



STATE OF NEW YORK  
OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

ERIC T. SCHNEIDERMAN  
ATTORNEY GENERAL

DIVISION OF SOCIAL JUSTICE  
CIVIL RIGHTS BUREAU  
LOURDES M. ROSADO, BUREAU CHIEF

December 29, 2017

**BY ELECTRONIC FILING**

The Honorable Nicholas G. Garaufis  
United States District Judge  
Eastern District of New York  
United States Courthouse  
Room 1416 S  
225 Cadman Plaza East  
Brooklyn, New York 11201

**RE: *New York et al. v. Trump et al.*, 17-cv-5228  
Format for January 18, 2018 oral argument**

Dear Judge Garaufis:

Plaintiff States in the above-captioned matter write this letter to request clarification on certain logistics for the oral argument scheduled for January 18, 2018 on the pending motions in these matters.<sup>1</sup> In order to be fully prepared to present argument in the format most helpful to the Court, Plaintiff States respectfully request guidance on the following questions:

- The start time of the hearing;
- The order in which the pending motions will be heard;
- The time allocated for each motion to be heard; and
- The overall format of the argument. Specifically, will the Court follow a traditional argument format—i.e., the movant argues first, then the opposing party, and the movant has the opportunity for rebuttal—for each of the pending motions? Or does the Court plan to follow another format?

---

<sup>1</sup> Currently pending before the Court are the motions in the above-captioned matter, as well as in *Batalla Vidal et al. v. Baran et al.*, 16-cv-04756. Specifically, both Plaintiffs' motions for a preliminary injunction; the *Batalla Vidal* Plaintiffs' motion for class certification; and Defendants' motions to dismiss both matters for failure to state a claim.

Plaintiff States appreciate any guidance Your Honor can provide on these questions as this information will allow us to prepare so as to make the best use of the Court's time. The *Batalla Vidal* Plaintiffs and Defendants do not object to this request.

Thank you.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Lourdes M. Rosado

Lourdes M. Rosado  
Bureau Chief, Civil Rights Bureau  
New York State Office of the Attorney General  
120 Broadway, 23rd Floor  
New York, New York 10271  
(212) 416-8252 Direct  
(212) 416-6030 Fax  
E-mail Address: [Lourdes.Rosado@ag.ny.gov](mailto:Lourdes.Rosado@ag.ny.gov)

*Counsel for Plaintiff States*

cc: Counsel for *Batalla Vidal* Plaintiffs (By ECF)  
Counsel for Defendants (By ECF)